FILED AHCA AGENCY CLERK 2009 NOV -3 A II: 17

STATE OF FLORIDA AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION

GOOD SHEPHERD HOSPICE, INC.,

Petitioner, vs.	DOAH CASE NO.: 09-1753CON AHCA CASE NO.: 2009003916 CON NOS. 10036-10038
STATE OF FLORIDA, AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION,	
Respondent.	,
HOPE HOSPICE AND COMMUNITY SERVICES, INC.,	
Petitioner,	DOAH CASE NO.: 09-1754CON AHCA CASE NO.: 2009004034
vs.	CON NOS. 10036-10038
STATE OF FLORIDA, AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION and COMPASSIONATE CARE HOSPICE OF MIAMI-DADE, INC.,	
Respondent.	•
ODYSSEY HEALTH CARE OF COLLIER COUNTY, INC.,	
Petitioner,	
Vs.	DOAH CASE NO.: 09-1755CON AHCA CASE NO.: 2009003644
STATE OF FLORIDA, AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION,	CON NOS. 10036-10038
Respondent.	_/

FINAL ORDER

THIS CAUSE comes before the AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION (the "Agency") concerning Certificate of Need ("CON") Application No. 10036, which was filed by Compassionate Care Hospice of Miami-Dade, Inc. (hereinafter "Compassionate"), in the Second Batching Cycle of 2008, requesting a CON to establish a hospice program. Compassionate was the approved applicant.

On April 3, 2009, Good Shepherd Hospice, Inc. (hereinafter "Good Shepherd") filed a Petition for Formal Administrative Hearing challenging Agency's approval of CON 10036, which was forwarded by the Agency Clerk to the Division of Administrative Hearings ("DOAH").

On April 3, 2009, Hope Hospice and Community Services, Inc. (hereinafter "Hope") filed a Petition for Formal Administrative Hearing challenging Agency's approval of CON 10036, to Compassionate which was forwarded by the Agency Clerk to the Division of Administrative Hearings ("DOAH").

On April 3, 2009, Odyssey Health Care of Collier County Inc. (hereinafter "Odyssey") filed a Petition for Formal Administrative Hearing challenging Agency's approval of CON 10036 to Compassionate which was forwarded by the Agency Clerk to the Division of Administrative Hearings ("DOAH").

On April 15, 2009, the DOAH Case Nos. 09-1753CON, 09-1754CON, and 09-1755CON were consolidated pursuant to Florida Administrative Code Rule 28-106.108 by the Administrative Law Judge.

On July 24, 2009, Odyssey filed a Notice of Voluntary Dismissal dismissing its challenge to the Agency's approval of CON #10036 to Compassionate. A copy of the Notice of Voluntary Dismissal is attached as Exhibit A.

On August 14, 2009, Hope and Good Shepherd each filed a Notice of Voluntary Dismissal with the Agency Clerk. A copy of the Notice of Voluntary Dismissal filed by Hope is attached as Exhibit B. A copy of the Notice of Voluntary Dismissal filed by Good Shepherd is attached as Exhibit C.

It is therefore **ORDERED** and **ADJUDGED**:

- The Notice of Voluntary Dismissal of Good Shepherd, Hope and Odyssey is acknowledged and accepted.
- 2. Certificate of Need ("CON") Application No. 10036, which was filed by Compassionate Care Hospice of Miami-Dade, Inc. (hereinafter "Compassionate") is hereby approved.
 - 3. The above-styled case is hereby closed.

DONE and ORDERED this 30 day of October, 2009, in Tallahassee, Florida.

THOMAS W. ARNOLD, Secretary
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION

NOTICE OF RIGHT TO JUDICIAL REVIEW

A PARTY WHO IS ADVERSELY AFFECTED BY THIS FINAL ORDER IS ENTITLED TO JUDICIAL REVIEW, WHICH SHALL BE INSTITUTED BY FILING THE ORIGINAL NOTICE OF APPEAL WITH THE AGENCY CLERK OF AHCA, AND A COPY ALONG WITH THE FILING FEE PRESCRIBED BY LAW WITH THE DISTRICT COURT OF APPEAL IN THE APPELLATE DISTRICT WHERE THE AGENCY MAINTAINS ITS HEADQUARTERS OR WHERE A PARTY RESIDES. REVIEW PROCEEDINGS SHALL BE CONDUCTED IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE FLORIDA APPELLATE RULES. THE NOTICE OF APPEAL MUST BE FILED WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE RENDITION OF THE ORDER TO BE REVIEWED.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing Final Order has been furnished by U.S. or interoffice mail to the persons named below on this 3 day of Movember, 2009.

RICHARD J. SHOOP, Agency Clerk Agency for Health Care Administration 2727 Mahan Drive, Mail Stop #3 Tallahassee, Florida 32308 (850) 922-5873

COPIES FURNISHED TO:

David M. Maloney
Administrative Law Judge
Division of Administrative Hearings
The DeSoto Building
1230 Apalachee Parkway
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-3060

Geoff D. Smith, Esquire
Susan C. Smith, Esquire
Timothy B. Elliott, Esquire
Smith & Associates, P.A.
2873 Remington Green Circle
Tallahassee, Florida 32308
Attorneys for Compassionate Care Hospice of Miami-Dade, Inc.

W. David Watkins, Esquire
Karl D. Acuff, Esquire
Watkins & Associates, P.A.
Post Office Box 15828
Tallahassee, Florida 32317-5828
Attorneys for Hope Hospice and Community Services

J. Robert Griffin, Esquire
J. Robert Griffin, P.A.
1342 Timberlane Road, Suite 102-A
Tallahassee, Florida 32312
Attorney for Hope Hospice and Community Services

Mark A. Emanuele, Esquire
Deborah S. Platz, Esquire
Ross D. Kulberg, Esquire
Panza, Maurer & Maynard, P.A.
Bank of America Building, Third Floor
3600 North Federal Highway
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33308
Attorneys for Odyssey Healthcare of Collier County, Inc.

Seann M. Frazier, Esquire Greenberg Traurig, P.A. 101 East College Avenue Tallahassee, Florida 32302 Attorney for Good Shepherd Hospice, Inc.

H. Darrell White, Esquire Vice President/General Counsel HPC Healthcare, Inc. 12973 Telecom Parkway, Suite 100 Temple Terrace, Florida 33637 Attorney for Good Shepherd Hospice, Inc.

Richard Joseph Saliba, Esquire Assistant General Counsel Agency for Health Care Administration 2727 Mahan Drive, Building 3, MS #3 Tallahassee, Florida 32308 (By Interoffice Mail)

Janice Mills
Government Analyst II
Facilities Intake
Agency for Health Care Administration
2727 Mahan Drive, Building 3, MS #3
Tallahassee, Florida 32308
(By Interoffice Mail)

STATE OF FLORIDA DIVISION OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

GOOD SHEPHERD HOSPICE, INC.,)
Petitioner, vs.) Case No. 09-1753CON
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION,)))
Respondent.))
HOPE HOSPICE AND COMMUNITY SERVICES, INC.,))
Petitioner, vs.	Case No. 09-1754CON
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION and COMPASSIONATE CARE HOSPICE OF MIAMI-DADE, INC.,))))
Respondents.))
ODYSSEY HEALTH CARE OF COLLIER COUNTY, INC.,)))
Petitioner, vs.	Case No. 09-1755CON)
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION,)))
Respondent.	ý)

NOTICE OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL

COMES NOW, Petitioner, Odyssey Healthcare of Collier County, Inc., by and through undersigned counsel, and hereby gives notice of the voluntary dismissal, with prejudice, of its Petition For Formal Administrative Hearing in the above-captioned case, and dismissal of its CON Application Number 10038.

Respectfully submitted this <u>a4</u> day of July, 2009.

Mark A. Emanuele

Florida Bar No.

Panza, Maurer & Maynard, P.A. Bank of America Building, Third Floor 3600 North Federal Highway

Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33308

Attorneys for Odyssey Healthcare of Collier County, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that copies of the foregoing have been furnished by email to the following this 23rd day of July, 2009.

Richard Saliba Assistant General Counsel Agency for Health Care Administration 2727 Mahan Drive, Building 3 Tallahassee, Florida 32308

Mark Emanuele
Deborah S. Platz
Panza, Maurer & Maynard, P.A.
Bank of America Building, Third Floor
3600 North Federal Highway
Ft. Lauderdale, Florida 33308

W. David Watkins Watkins & Associates, P.A. 3051 Highland Oaks Terrace, Ste. D Tallahassee, FL 32308

Seann Frazier Greenberg Traurig, P.A. 101 East College Avenue Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Mark A. EMANUELE

STATE OF FLORIDA AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION

GOOD SHEPHERD HOSPICE, INC.,	
Petitioner,	DOAH Case No. 09-1753CON AHCA Case No. 2009003916
٧.	
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION,	
Respondent,/	
HOPE HOSPICE AND COMMUNITY SERVICES, INC.,	
Petitioner, v.	DOAH Case No. 09-1754CON AHCA Case No. 2009004034
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION and COMPASSIONATE CARE HOSPICE OF MIAMI-DADE, IN	NC.
Respondents,	

HOPE HOSPICE AND COMMUNITY SERVICES, INC.'S NOTICE OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL

Petitioner, HOPE HOSPICE AND COMMUNITY SERVICES, INC., by and through undersigned counsel, hereby files this notice of voluntary dismissal and dismisses its petition.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 14th day of August, 2009:

WATKINS & ASSOCIATES, P.A. 3051 Highland Oaks Terrace, Suite D P. O. Box 15828 Tallahassee, FL 32317-5828 (850) 671-2644 - Telephone (850) 671-2732 - Facsimile

W. David Walkins, Esq. Florida Bar No. 437190

EXHIBIT Services

Ĺ.

Karl David Acuff, Esq. Florida Bar No. 587044

and

J. Robert Griffin, Esq. 1342 Timberlane Road, Suite 102-A Tallahassee, FL 32312

Counsel for Hope Hospice and Community Services, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that an original of the foregoing has been filed with the AHCA Clerk via Hand Delivery and served as indicated below this 14th day of August, 2009, to:

Richard J. Saliba, Esquire Agency for Health Care Administration 2727 Mahan Drive, Building 3 Tallahassee, Florida 32308 Via Electronic Mail

Geoffrey D. Smith, Esquire Smith and Associates 2873 Remington Green Circle Tallahassee, Florida 32308 Via Electronic Mail

Seann M. Frazier GREENBERG TRAURIG, P.A. 101 E. College Avenue Post Office Drawer 1838 Tallahassee, FL 32302

Via Electronic Mail

H. Darrell White Vice President and General Counsel HPC Healthcare, Inc. 12973 Telecom Parkway, Suite 100 Temple Terrace, Florida 33637 Via Electronic Mail

W. David Watkins, Esq.



GOOD SHEPHERD HOSPICE, INC.

Petitioner,

FRAES No.

2009004034

CON Nos.

10036

10037

VS.

10038

STATE OF FLORIDA, AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION,

Respondent.

NOTICE OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL

Good Shepherd Hospice, Inc. voluntarily dismisses its petition in this proceeding, with prejudice.

Dated this 14th day of August, 2009.

Seann M. Frazier, Esq.

GREENBERG TRAURIG, P.A.

101 E. College Avenue Post Office Drawer 1838

Tallahassee, FL 32302

and

H. Darrell White, Esq. Vice President and General Counsel HPC Healthcare, Inc. 12973 Telecom Parkway, Suite 100 Temple Terrace, Florida 33637

Counsel for Good Shepherd Hospice, Inc. and LifePath Hospice, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been provided to

the following this 14th day of August, 2009:

Richard Saliba Assistant General Counsel Agency for Health Care Administration 2727 Mahan Drive, Building 3 Tallahassee, FL 32308 Via Electronic & U.S. Mail

David Watkins Karl Acuff Watkins & Associates, P.A. 3051 Highland Oaks Terrace, Suite D P.O. Box 15828 Tallahassee, Florida 32317-5828

Via Electronic & U.S. Mail

Geoffrey D. Smith Susan Smith Smith & Associates 2873 Remington Green Circle Tallahassee, Florida 32312

Via Electronic & U.S. Mail

Mark A. Emanuele Panza, Maurer & Maynard, P.A. 3600 N. Federal Highway, Third Floor Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33308

Via Electronic & U.S. Mail

J. Robert Griffin 1342 Timberlane Road Suite 102-A Tallahassee, Florida 23212

Via Electronic & U.S. Mail

Seann M. Frazier, Ese

TAL 451,525,129v1 8-14-09

STATE OF FLORIDA AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION

FILED

AHCA
AGENCY CLERK

GOOD SHEPHERI	HOSPICE, INC.
---------------	---------------

2009 AUG 12 A 8: 14

Petitioner,

DOAH CASE NO. 09-1753CON AHCA CASE NO. 2009003916 CON NOS. 10036-10038

VS.

STATE OF FLORIDA, AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION,

Respondent.

HOPE HOSPICE AND COMMUNITY SERVICES, INC.,

Petitioner,

VS.

DOAH CASE NO. 09-1754CON AHCA CASE NO. 2009004034 CON NOS. 10036-10038

STATE OF FLORIDA, AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION and COMPASSIONATE CARE HOSPICE OF MIAMI-DADE, INC.,

Respondent.

ODYSSEY HEALTH CARE OF COLLIER COUNTY, INC.,

Petitioner,

DOAH CASE NO. 09-1755CON AHCA CASE NO. 2009003644 CON NO. 10038

vs.

STATE OF FLORIDA, AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION

t.

FINAL ORDER



THIS CAUSE comes before the AGENCY FORM MEADTHA CARE
ADMINISTRATION (the "Agency") concerning Certificate of Need ("CON")
Application No. 10038 which was filed by ODYSSEY HEALTHCARE OF
COLLIER COUNTY, INC. (hereinafter "Odyssey") in the Second Batching
Cycle of 2008, requesting a CON to establish a hospice program. The
application was denied.

Thereafter, Odyssey timely filed a Petition for Formal Administrative Hearing with respect to the denial, which was forwarded by the Agency Clerk to the Division of Administrative Hearings ("DOAH").

On July 24, 2009, Odyssey filed its voluntary dismissal of the DOAH case. Notice of Voluntary Dismissal is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

On July 28, 2009, an Order Closing File was issued by DOAH as a result of the voluntary dismissal. Order Closing File is attached hereto as Exhibit B.

It is therefore **ORDERED** and **ADJUDGED**:

- 1. The voluntary dismissal by Odyssey and the Order Closing File by DOAH are hereby acknowledged and accepted.
 - 2. CON Application No. 10038 is hereby denied.
 - 3. The above-styled case is hereby closed.

DONE and ORDERED this 16th day of August , 2009, in Tallahassee, Florida.

HOLLY BENSON, Secretary
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION

NOTICE OF RIGHT TO JUDICIAL REVIEW

A PARTY WHO IS ADVERSELY AFFECTED BY THIS FINAL ORDER IS ENTITLED TO JUDICIAL REVIEW, WHICH SHALL BE INSTITUTED BY FILING THE ORIGINAL NOTICE OF APPEAL WITH THE AGENCY CLERK OF AHCA, AND A COPY ALONG WITH THE FILING FEE PRESCRIBED BY LAW WITH THE DISTRICT COURT OF APPEAL IN THE APPELLATE DISTRICT WHERE THE AGENCY MAINTAINS ITS HEADQUARTERS OR WHERE A PARTY RESIDES. REVIEW PROCEEDINGS SHALL BE CONDUCTED IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE FLORIDA APPELLATE RULES. THE NOTICE OF APPEAL MUST BE FILED WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE RENDITION OF THE ORDER TO BE REVIEWED.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing Final Order has been furnished by U.S. or interoffice mail to the persons named below on this 12th day of Augus (2009.

RICHARD J. SHOOP, Agency Clerk Agency for Health Care Administration 2727 Mahan Drive, Mail Stop #3 Tallahassee, Florida 32308 (850) 922-5873

COPIES FURNISHED TO:

David M. Maloney
Administrative Law Judge
Division of Administrative Hearings
The DeSoto Building
1230 Apalachee Parkway
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-3060

Geoff D. Smith, Esquire
Susan C. Smith, Esquire
Timothy B. Elliott, Esquire
Smith & Associates, P.A.
2873 Remington Green Circle
Tallahassee, Florida 32308
Attorneys for Compassionate Care Hospice of Miami-Dade, Inc.

W. David Watkins, Esquire
Karl D. Acuff, Esquire
Watkins & Associates, P.A.
Post Office Box 15828
Tallahassee, Florida 32317-5828
Attorneys for Hope Hospice and Community Services

J. Robert Griffin, Esquire
J. Robert Griffin, P.A.
1342 Timberlane Road, Suite 102-A
Tallahassee, Florida 32312
Attorney for Hope Hospice and Community Services

Mark A. Emanuele, Esquire
Deborah S. Platz, Esquire
Ross D. Kulberg, Esquire
Panza, Maurer & Maynard, P.A.
Bank of America Building, Third Floor
3600 North Federal Highway
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33308
Attorneys for Odyssey Healthcare of Collier County, Inc.

Seann M. Frazier, Esquire Greenberg Traurig, P.A. 101 East College Avenue Tallahassee, Florida 32302 Attorney for Good Shepherd Hospice, Inc. H. Darrell White, Esquire Vice President/General Counsel HPC Healthcare, Inc. 12973 Telecom Parkway, Suite 100 Temple Terrace, Florida 33637 Attorney for Good Shepherd Hospice, Inc.

Richard Joseph Saliba, Esquire Assistant General Counsel Agency for Health Care Administration 2727 Mahan Drive, Building 3, MS #3 Tallahassee, Florida 32308 (By Interoffice Mail)

Elizabeth Dudek
Deputy Secretary
Agency for Health Care Administration
2727 Mahan Drive, Building 3, MS #9
Tallahassee, Florida 32308
(By Interoffice Mail)

Janice Mills
Government Analyst II
Facilities Intake
Agency for Health Care Administration
2727 Mahan Drive, Building 3, MS #3
Tallahassee, Florida 32308
(By Interoffice Mail)

STATE OF FLORIDA DIVISION OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

GOOD SHEPHERD HOSPICE, INC.,)
Petitioner, vs.) Case No. 09-1753CON
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE ADMINISTRATION,))
Respondent.))
HOPE HOSPICE AND COMMUNITY SERVICES, INC.,)))
Petitioner,) Case No. 09-1754CON
VS.))
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE)
ADMINISTRATION and)
COMPASSIONATE CARE HOSPICE OF)
MIAMI-DADE, INC.,	
Respondents.)
ODYSSEY HEALTH CARE OF COLLIER)
COUNTY, INC.,)
)
Petitioner,) Case No. 09-1755CON
VS.	
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE)
ADMINISTRATION,)
i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i)
Respondent.	,)

NOTICE OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL

COMES NOW, Petitioner, Odyssey Healthcare of Collier County, Inc., by and through undersigned counsel, and hereby gives notice of the voluntary dismissal, with prejudice, of its Petition For Formal Administrative Hearing in the above-captioned case, and dismissal of its CON Application Number 10038.



Respectfully submitted this <u>a4</u> day of July, 2009.

Mark A. Emanuele

Florida Bar No.

Panza, Maurer & Maynard, P.A. Bank of America Building, Third Floor 3600 North Federal Highway Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33308

Attorneys for Odyssey Healthcare of Collier County, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that copies of the foregoing have been furnished by email to the following this 23rd day of July, 2009.

Richard Saliba Assistant General Counsel Agency for Health Care Administration 2727 Mahan Drive, Building 3 Tallahassee, Florida 32308

Mark Emanuele
Deborah S. Platz
Panza, Maurer & Maynard, P.A.
Bank of America Building, Third Floor
3600 North Federal Highway
Ft. Lauderdale, Florida 33308

W. David Watkins Watkins & Associates, P.A. 3051 Highland Oaks Terrace, Ste. D Tallahassee, FL 32308

Seann Frazier Greenberg Traurig, P.A. 101 East College Avenue Tallahassee, Florida 32301

MARK A. EMANUELE

STATE OF FLORIDA DIVISION OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

GOOD SHEPHERD HOSPICE, INC.,)		
Petitioner,)		
vs.)	Cogo No	00 1752CON
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE) ADMINISTRATION,)	case No.	09-1753CON
Respondent.)		
HOPE HOSPICE AND COMMUNITY) SERVICES, INC.,)		
Petitioner,)		
vs.)	Case No.	09-1754CON
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE) ADMINISTRATION and) COMPASSIONATE CARE HOSPICE OF) MIAMI-DADE, INC.,)		
Respondents.)		
ODYSSEY HEALTH CARE FO COLLIER) COUNTY, INC.,		
Petitioner,)		
vs. ,)	Case No.	09-1755CON
AGENCY FOR HEALTH CARE) ADMINISTRATION,)		
Respondent.)		

ORDER CLOSING FILE

This cause having come before the Administrative Law Judge on the Notice of Voluntary Dismissal of Petitioner, Odyssey Healthcare of Collier County, Inc., filed on July 24, 2009, and the undersigned being fully advised, it is, therefore,

ORDERED that:

- 1. The final hearing in this cause scheduled for September 1 through 4, 9 through 11, 14 through 18, 21, 22 and 28 through 30, 2009, is hereby canceled in Case No. 09-1755CON.
- 2. The file of the Division of Administrative Hearings in the above-captioned matter is hereby closed. Jurisdiction is hereby relinquished to the Agency for Health Care Administration.

DONE AND ORDERED this 28th day of July, 2009, in Tallahassee, Leon County, Florida.

DAVID M. MALONEY

121 de duel

Administrative Law Judge
Division of Administrative Hearings
The DeSoto Building
1230 Apalachee Parkway
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-3060
(850) 488-9675
Fax Filing (850) 921-6847
www.doah.state.fl.us

Filed with the Clerk of the Division of Administrative Hearings this 28th day of July, 2009.

COPIES FURNISHED:

J. Robert Griffin, Esquire J. Robert Griffin, P.A. 1342 Timberlane Road, Suite 102-A Tallahassee, Florida 32312-1762 Richard Joseph Saliba, Esquire Agency for Health Care Administration 2727 Mahan Drive, Building 3, Mail Station 3 Tallahassee, Florida 32308

W. David Watkins, Esquire Watkins & Associates, P.A. Post Office Box 15828 Tallahassee, Florida 32317-582

Geoffrey D. Smith, Esquire Smith & Associates 2873 Remington Green Circle Tallahassee, Florida 32308